

### **North Area (Broughton Street to Canonmills) ETRO (TRO/21/27B)**

The New Town and Broughton Community Council (NTBCC) objects to the retention of many of the measures introduced under the Spaces for People initiative along the route from Canonmills to Broughton Street. These were intended to be a temporary response to the pandemic. There is no longer a justification to retain many of these measures or continue to evaluate them using an ETRO. Instead, those that are no longer serving a useful purpose should be removed immediately and those that have proven their value should be made permanent. The nature of the temporary measures does not properly support increased active travel and has created additional hazards for pedestrians, cyclists and other road users as well as increasing congestion on a busy arterial route leading to more air pollution in a residential and local neighbourhood area.

We also note that the plans provided with the ETRO only provide information on the waiting and loading restrictions. Apart from within the stated reasons for ETRO, no information is provided on the actual measures which were the reason for introducing the revised waiting and loading restrictions. This makes it very difficult for members of the public to provide meaningful feedback on the ETRO.

No evidence has been provided of any monitoring that has been undertaken while this ETRO has been in effect nor does the ETRO set out any plans for such monitoring which is surely one of the key reasons for continuing to have these temporary measures in place. NTBCC requested greater involvement in decisions regarding these temporary measures through a Participation Request but was persuaded that this could be accomplished through more informal means. Unfortunately, this engagement with the local community has not been delivered.

The original Spaces for People measures and their subsequent retention using the ETRO has been a missed opportunity to address the concerns raised by local residents and businesses. Following consultation conducted by the New Town and Broughton Community Council in 2021, it was clear that increasing pavement widths and making the area safer for pedestrians were the priorities for most respondents. These priorities have been largely ignored by the changes introduced by the Council under the Spaces for People initiative.

We urge the Council to look again at the active travel needs of this neighbourhood area with a new perspective that properly responds to the needs of the community.

We have set out below our position on each of the measures and associated waiting/loading restrictions by referencing the specific sheet numbers of the drawings included with the ETRO.

### **Sheet 1**

The sheet shows a section of no waiting or loading on the southbound side of Canonmills between Munro Place and Broughton Road. This change should be made permanent to remove parked or waiting vehicles blocking a very narrow and congested section of road. These restrictions were introduced to remove potential blockages for cyclists and other vehicles using this section of road approaching the junction with Broughton Road. This was one of a number of measures intended to improve the safety of this junction for cyclists and pedestrians. It would appear that some of these measures have been quietly forgotten.

We raised particular concerns due the very narrow width of pavement on the north side of Broughton Road given the significant number of pedestrians using this section of pavement. Nothing was done to extend the width of this pavement/waiting area. The ETRO could have been used to evaluate a reconfiguration of this junction to increase space for pedestrians. There was also a no right-hand turn introduced at this junction to prevent south bound traffic turning into Eyre Place. This was intended to improve traffic flows at this junction and thus reduce the likelihood of traffic build-up back towards Huntley Street. We have noted that the road sign has been removed. Why has this restriction been removed? Given the uphill nature of this section of road for cyclists, consideration should have been given to introducing a segregated cycle path and an early start light for cyclists at this junction. Both measures would have a very positive impact on the safety of cyclists.

### **Sheet 2**

The sheet shows waiting and loading restrictions on the northbound side of Canonmills between the junction of Eyre Place and Huntley Street. We believe that these measures should be made permanent and loading restrictions should be extended to 24 hours per day on the section closest to Eyre Place as it is on a bend reducing visibility for approaching traffic and requiring cyclists to move into the centre of the road.

The waiting and loading restrictions at the junction of Rodney Street and Herriot Hill Terrace should be made permanent to reduce potential congestion for southbound traffic using Rodney Street, removing the need for cyclists to move into the centre of the road and improving visibility for traffic turning out of Herriot Hill Terrace.

The segregated cycle lane on the downhill northbound side of Rodney street should be removed as it ends abruptly at the first of two bus stops. Cyclists should instead be given priority in the main carriage way. The waiting and loading restrictions should be made permanent given the proximity of the bus stops on both sides of the road at this point. The loading restrictions should be extended to cover the full period that bus services operate on this route. Priority should be given to improving the segregated cycle lane on the opposite uphill southbound side of the road especially as it passes the bus stop.

### **Sheet 3**

We support the continuation of the parking and loading restrictions on west side Bellevue and Rodney Street but believe that the small sections of segregated cycle lane should not be retained on this downhill section of road. These are of limited benefit to cyclists who are entering and leaving these sections due to the presence of two bus stops on this side of the road, the junction with Cornwallis Place and a controlled pedestrian crossing. One of the missing elements of this sheet is the pavement build out at the north side of the junction with Cornwallis Place. This should either made permanent or removed as the temporary infrastructure is a hazard to pedestrians especially those who are wheeling or visually impaired. The segregated cycle lane on the east uphill side of Rodney Street beyond the bus stop by Herriot Hill Terrace to East Claremont Street should be made permanent and the temporary pavement build out removed to provide more space for this cycle lane.

### **Sheet 4**

Again, this sheet fails to show many of the Spaces for People measures which are being retained under this ETRO. The segregated cycle lane on the west side of Bellevue should be removed as it does not serve any useful purpose and increases the risks to cyclists leaving the cycle lane just before the bus stop and re-entering the main carriageway. The parking and loading restrictions should be made permanent to reduce the need for cyclists to avoid parked cars especially given the number of junctions and the pedestrian crossing island between East Claremont Street and Bellevue Place.

In contrast the lack of a dedicated cycle lane on the east uphill side of Bellevue reduces the benefit of the segregated cycle lane from Rodney Street. Given

that this route is part of the National Cycle Network, consideration should be given to creating a segregated cycle lane from East Claremont Street to the Broughton Roundabout. This would require some modification of the side junctions and the bus stop on Mansfield Place. The sheet shows no pavement build out at the centre refuge of the East Claremont Street junction. The temporary measures should be made permanent to improve pedestrian safety by restricting the width of the junction.

### **Sheet 5**

The sheet once more fails to show the extent of the temporary measures introduced under the Spaces for People which this ETRO is seeking to retain. These measures include roadway width restrictions and pavement extensions. We object to the retention of these measures around the Broughton roundabout. The pavement widths are already more than adequate and by providing the temporary build outs, pedestrians are encouraged to cross the roads adjacent to the roundabout away from the controlled crossings increasing the risk to them of an accident. As a consequence of these buildouts, traffic is constrained to a single lane entering and leaving the roundabout increasing congestion and thus atmospheric pollution.

The temporary barriers that were installed in the centre of Mansfield Place were never justified by the need to provide additional space for active travel and should be removed. If it is deemed necessary to restrict the ability of vehicles to cross the carriageway, then this should be approved under a full TRO. The section of no parking and loading restrictions on the west side of Broughton Street on the approach to the roundabout should be removed to provide additional parking and loading space for residents, disabled drivers, businesses and visitors. Further consideration of this junction should be undertaken to improve the safety of cyclists travelling along the National Cycle Route and to restrict through traffic along East London Street.

### **Sheet 6**

This sheet shows additional waiting and loading restrictions on the east side of Broughton Street between Broughton Place and Forth Street. What is not shown is the small section of segregated cycle lane. This should be removed, and further effort should be focussed on improving cyclist safety on the National Cycle Route and in particular Dublin Street with its direct connections to the CCWEL route. Broughton Street is not a suitable route for southbound cyclists to be using to access the City Centre due to the significant conflicts identified by the Council in the 'Our Future Streets Technical Summary Report' presented to the Transport and Environment Committee in February 2024.

The temporary build-out of the pavement on the corner of Barony Street and Broughton Street should be made permanent and the temporary measures removed as they pose a hazard to pedestrians especially those with restricted mobility or vision.

All of the waiting restrictions in this section of Broughton Street should be re-evaluated based on the impact of the communal bin review in this area and the loss of other parking spaces in adjacent streets.

### **Sheet 7**

The sheet shows additional loading and waiting restrictions on the southbound side of Broughton Street between Broughton Place approaching the junction with Picardy Place. We believe that these restrictions are beneficial to maintaining proper traffic flow at this junction. This encourages traffic to use this route to access Picardy Place rather than use other routes including East London Street to avoid congestion. This change should be made permanent, and the restrictions apply 24 hours per day.

The sheet shows a no waiting area on the north side of Forth Street close the junction with Broughton Street but with loading allowed during certain times. We objected to this becoming a loading area as Forth Street is a one-way street thus requiring any commercial vehicles that have completed their loading/unloading operations to travel through narrow residential streets in order to return to the main road. Having checked the actual site, it would appear that the sign showing the loading restrictions has been removed so that this is now apparently only a no waiting area. While there is some benefit of removing parked vehicles near the junction this has resulted in loss of parking spaces for residents and people using the shops on Broughton Street. This change should be reviewed when the TRO for the next phase of the communal bin review is prepared.

Also on this sheet is a new section of no waiting but with limited loading allowed on the northbound side of Broughton Street between York Lane and Albany Street. This is opposite a bus stop and loading area on the southbound side of the road. Given the proximity of this section of road to Albany Street, we agree that parking should be restricted especially as it is also close to a pedestrian island crossing. This change should be made permanent.