Minutes of New Town & Broughton Community Council's annual general meeting, held at Broughton St Mary's church on Monday 9 June 2025 at 7pm

Actions and decisions are RED ITALIC UNDERLINED SMALLCAPS. *ND* ('no dissent') means that no-one spoke or voted against a decision.

URLs have been added by the minutes secretary.

Actions (to be omitted from online version)

Item	Actor	Action
3.f	B Ryan	Get login details for Nextdoor account set up for NTBCC
6	B Ryan	Set up necessary convenor email addresses, and enable convenors to access them, as well as enabling new office bearers to access those addresses.

Items 1 to 4 were chaired by P Williamson, item 5 by B Ryan, item 6 and the following ordinary meeting by P Williamson.

1 Welcome and apologies

1.a Attendance

Fiona Banatvala	NTBCC	Joe McAdam	NTBCC	Peter Williamson	NTBCC
Michael Birch	NTBCC	Susan MacInnes	NTBCC	Cllr Jo Mowat	City centre ward
Pierre Forissier	NTBCC	Richard Price	NTBCC	Cllr Jack Caldwell	Leith Walk ward
Stephen Hajducki	NTBCC	Nicholas Reid	NTBCC	Alan McIntosh	*Broughton Spurtle*
Shaun Hodge	NTBCC	David Renton	NTBCC	At least 3 residents/visitors	
Simon Holledge	NTBCC	Vanessa Roëves	NTBCC		
Ken Lochrie	NTBCC	Gerald Wells	NTBCC		

1.b Apologies

Stuart McAllister	NTBCC	Cllr Hal Osler	Stockbridge and Inverleith ward

2 Formal approval of 2024 AGM minutes

- Accepted as-is (proposed M Birch, seconded D Renton, *ND*)
- It was noted that updates to CEC licensing software are not yet in place.

3 Annual reports

The points below should be read in conjunction with the linked reports.

3.a Chair (P Williamson)

- NTBCC deals with a lot of items.
- Its walkabouts have value – it looks forward to more of these.
- NTBCC needs to engage more effectively with its community. Communications with residents could be improved. However, community councils are among the most trusted types of organisations.
- NTBCC needs to strengthen its engagement with Edinburgh World Heritage.
- NTBCC's work is currently driven by CEC. Is this appropriate? Could it take on other topics, e.g. children/young people?
- NTBCC thanks its CEC councillors for their very positive involvement and help.
- NTBCC thanks its convenors, officers and other contributors.

3.b Planning (R Price)

- NTBCC has made ~20 submissions over the past year.
  It does not have a convenor, but takes a collaborative approach.
- NTBCC's contact form has been a route to residents' issues. It picks up issues from the weekly planning lists, by following the local review body and from the Scottish reporter, due to more appeals being submitted.
- Many short-term let applications, especially for certificates of lawfulness, are in progress.
- Experience suggests that NTBCC is not very influential on planning. It could use the 'statutory consultee' route more.

3.c Licensing (A Gaillard)

- A report will be published soon.
- A consultation on gambling policy is open to 22 June. In NTBCC's area, only one operation might be affected.
- There have been questions about the consistency admitting children and young people to licensed premises.
- There is increasing encroachment on roads by pubs etc, leading to conflict with pedestrian movement. Tables and chairs currently can only be on pavements from 9am but some premises wish to start sooner for the breakfast trade.
- There is ongoing considerable confusion over the two types of short-term letting license.
- The alcohol overprovision policy is still under consideration. However, there have been few concerning license applications in NTBCC's area this year.
- It is not possible to see Section 50 (serve alcohol on premises) applications or even completed decisions.
- Planning permission is granted to the property, while licenses are granted to individuals. This is causing some issues.

3.d Transport and environment (M Birch)

- **Trams**: there is now a list of over 800 outstanding issues. CEC is now working more positively, e.g. on Elm Row.
- **Active travel** – The Waverley ETRO was approved. The East Area ETRO has been deferred until September. The Broughton St/Canonmills ETRO will come to committee in 2025. CCs are not permitted to comment on ETRO reports, even if they contain errors.

DRAFT

- **City mobility plan**: see report.
- **Traffic noise (East London St etc)**: see report
- **Supported bus services**: our survey was helpful. However, what can be done to reduce the need for such subsidies?
- **Communal bin review**: NTBCC has been involved since 2021, leading to good collaboration with CEC. It's unfortunate that this hasn't continued.
- **Air pollution**: see report.
- **Street cleansing**: CEC statistics show improvement but this isn't NTBCC's experience.

3.e Culture & communities (S Holledge)

- The NTBCC Culture & Communities Committee shadows the CEC Culture & Communities Committee, one of the six 'political committees' of the council.
- NTBCC has held ad hoc meetings on issues of interest to members, rather than regular committee meetings, as a reflection of the diverse content that comes to the CEC committee.
- Matters of public interest considered at both NTBCC and ad hoc meetings includedfirework control zones, details of the tourist visitor levy, the 'Winter Festivals' in Princes Street Gardens, management rules for public parks and greenspace, while commenting formally on the draft 'Princes Street and Waverley Valley Strategy', and the proposed installation for an extended period of the 'Big Wheel' in East Princes Street Gardens (which in line with our advice didn't happen), and the Fly Music Festival (West Princes Street Gardens).

3.f Engagement (S Holledge)

- The Engagement Plan included sections on changes under the City of Education Council Scheme and Boundary review for community councils, NTBCC's seven natural neighbourhoods, the distribution of NTBCC community councillors by street of residence, explanation of past video-conferencing and in person meetings, use of noticeboards for meeting notices, the NTBCC website, the use of X/twitter and Bluesky micro-blogging social media, residents associations and their membership of NTBCCX, walkabouts, a list of formal responses to local government consultations and deputations to council committees, engagement with other community councils and other external organisations, links to previous Engagement Plans (2020-2024) and a list of six suggestions for future engagement.
- It was suggested that NTBCC could use Instagram, facebook and Nextdoor as well as its website, X and BlueSky
  - *ACTION: B RYAN TO GET THE LOGIN DETAILS FOR AN NEXTDOOR ACCOUNT FROM A FORMER NTBCC MEMBER*.

4 Approval of Annual Accounts for Financial Year 2024-25

- NTBCC basically broke even over the financial year.
- Although the annual CEC grant did not change, NTBCC has reduced costs thanks to alternate online meetings.
- Despite this, there is concern that NTBCC might go into deficit. CEC has made no commitment around such issues. However, NTBCC may qualify for some supplementary funding this year. It could also apply for grants.
- There was discussion of which types of social media CEC uses, and whether the annual grant would change given the recent boundary changes. (NTBCC's population was reduced by the boundary change, so the grant might decrease.)

The accounts were approved as-is (proposed M Birch, seconded R Price, *ND*).

5 Election of office bearers

There was only one candidate for each role, apart from engagement officer: a job-share was proposed and accepted.

Self-nominations were permitted. M Birch was thanked for his work as both secretary and transport/environment convenor over the last year.

Role	Nominee	Proposer	Seconder	Outcome
Chair	P Williamson	G Wells	K Lochrie	Williamson elected
Vice-chair	R Price	R Price	P Forissier	Price elected
Secretary	S MacInnes	S MacInnes	P Williamson	MacInnes elected
Treasurer	N Reid	N Reid	M Birch	Reid elected
Engagement officer	F Banatvala and S Hodge	P Williamson	A Gaillard	Banatvala and Hodge elected

6 Election of committee convenors

The Engagement and communications roles were merged.

Role	Nominee	Other members
Culture and communities	No candidates. P Williamson will take on this role for now.	To be confirmed later
Licensing	A Gaillard	
Planning	R Price	
Transport and environment	M Birch	
Engagement and communications	F Banatvala and S Hodge	

- *ACTION: B RYAN TO SET UP NECESSARY CONVENOR EMAIL ADDRESSES, AND ENABLE CONVENORS TO ACCESS THEM, AS WELL AS ENABLING NEW OFFICE BEARERS TO ACCESS THOSE ADDRESSES*.
- There was discussion of where these roles came from, and how they might evolve.

7 Any other business

None

DRAFT

Minutes of New Town & Broughton Community Council's ordinary meeting, held at Broughton St Mary's church on Monday 9 June 2025 at 8pm

Actions and decisions are RED ITALIC UNDERLINED SMALLCAPS. *ND* ('no dissent') means that no-one spoke or voted against a decision.

URLs have been added by the minutes secretary.

Actions (to be omitted from online version)

Item	Actor	Action
3.a	M Birch NTBCC	Forward CEC survey on governance/election to NTBCC members NTBCC to hence submit written feedback
3.a	M Birch	Ask local councillors to ask Cllr Jenkinson to meet East London St residents
6.a	NTBCC	Hold a separate meeting to decide how to proceed about Blenheim Place
6.b	R Price	Circulate details of pre-application trams meeting about Thistle St
6.c	NTBCC	Hold a separate meeting on the former RBS site at Dundas St, including seeking honesty about letting intentions
6.d	R Price	Write a website post about CityScope
9.b	M Birch	Write to CEC officer to clarify NTBCC's position on city mobility plan capital investment
10	Cllr Mowat	Investigate CEC's plans around weeding
10	G Wells	Action: G Wells to compare NTBCC's current and previous constitution

1 Welcome and apologies

1.a Attendance

Fiona Banatvala	NTBCC	Joe McAdam	NTBCC	Peter Williamson	NTBCC
Michael Birch	NTBCC	Susan MacInnes	NTBCC	Cllr Jo Mowat	City centre ward
Pierre Forissier	NTBCC	Richard Price	NTBCC	Cllr Jack Caldwell	Leith Walk ward
Stephen Hajducki	NTBCC	Nicholas Reid	NTBCC	Alan McIntosh	*Broughton Spurtle*
Shaun Hodge	NTBCC	David Renton	NTBCC	At least 3 residents/visitors	
Simon Holledge	NTBCC	Vanessa Roëves	NTBCC		
Ken Lochrie	NTBCC	Gerald Wells	NTBCC		

1.b Apologies

Stuart McAllister	NTBCC	Cllr Hal Osler	Stockbridge and Inverleith ward

2 Declarations of interest

- Item 9.2: M Birch is member of EBUG.

3 Approval of minutes of May 2025 meeting and matters arising

Approved subject to deletion of a throwaway remark by G Wells in item 9.a

3.a Actions from May meeting

Item	Actor	Action	Status
3	M Birch	follow up on gaps in CEC's response about governance/CC election issues	In progress. *NTBCC TO PROVIDE WRITTEN FEEDBACK ON CC ELECTION PROCESS VIA CEC SURVEY* (*M BIRCH TO FORWARD IT TO MEMBERS*)
3	M Birch	ask Cllr Jenkinson to report on progress of his actions	Complete but the Cllr will not meet with ELS residents. *MB TO ASK LOCAL CLLRS TO ASK HIM TO CHANGE HIS MIND*.
4.a	A resident M Birch	Resident to forward his email to M Birch M Birch to forward it to the mailing list	complete
5.a.i	M Birch	Put S Hodge and J Buckley in contact.	complete
7.a	M Birch	share my response to what was said in the communal bins briefing with NTBCC members	complete
7.c	M Birch	circulate TEC meeting papers when they become available	complete
8.a	M Birch	Forward to A Gaillard correspondence about the Royal terrace aparthotel issues.	complete
9.a	S Hodge	Work on next steps for NTBCC's engagement, based on Napier project findings	complete
9.b	M Birch	Inform Cllr Mitchell about tables and chairs issues	complete

4 Police report

- No report was received. The next opportunity for police to come to an in-person meeting is September. This is because police cannot use Zoom.
  - There should be a report to CEC culture and communities on policing before that NTBCC meeting.

5 Chair's report

- none

6 Planning matters

6.a Planning Local Review Body decision – 12 Blenheim Place (R Price, A Gaillard)

- NTBCC has submitted a formal complaint, which is now at stage 2. However, it is unlikely that the original decision will be overturned. One of NTBCC's concerns here is that a novice member spearheaded the decision. Another is the short time between submission of NTBCC's complaint and the stage 1 decision.
  - The Cllr about whom NTBCC had most concerns regarding the original decision is no longer on the review body, following the CEC AGM in May.
  - Cllr Mowat: relevant Cllrs should receive at least refresher training each year.
- NTBCC needs to decide whether/how to pursue a decision change in the next few weeks. This could be expensive.
  - A relevant precedent is that an appeal over a shop-front sign has been taken to the Court of Session.
  - *ACTION: NTBCC TO HOLD A SEPARATE MEETING TO DECIDE HOW TO PROCEED*.

6.b Royal London pre-consultations: Thistle Street/Henderson Row (R Price)

- The developers have asked NTBCC for opinions prior to submitting planning applications.
- For Henderson Row, they have offered a Teams meeting this Wednesday at 6pm. (*ACTION: R PRICE TO CIRCULATE DETAILS*.)

6.c Former RBS site – Dundas St – new application lodged: 25/01899/FUL (R Price)

- This long-awaited application is to change plans from offices to residential, purpose-build student accommodation and one commercial premise. Comments can be submitted to 4 July. NTBCC has obtained statutory consulteeship.
  - *ACTION: NTBCC TO ORGANISE A SEPARATE MEETING*.
  - K Lochrie: permission for short-term lets has been granted for 22-24 Dunedin St. NTBCC should ask developers for honesty about the RBS site. (*ACTION: R PRICE/K LOCHRIE TO DISCUSS HOW TO RAISE THIS*.)

6.d Overview of tools to access planning information (R Price)

- *ACTION: R PRICE TO WRITE A WEBSITE POST ABOUT A NEW TOOL*: CityScope

6.e Recent planning applications and appeals (R Price)

- There are now revised documents for 7 Baxter's Place. (NTBCC objected to the plans for serviced apartments here.)

7 Licencing matters (A Gaillard)

- There have been no concerning alcohol license applications. The statement on overprovision of alcohol is awaited.
- A ban on aircraft flypasts has been deemed impossible: CEC has no relevant powers over the military.

8 Culture and communities matters

8.a Report of C&C Committee meeting held on 5 June 2025 (S Holledge)

- There were three interesting motions:
  - A motion against testing arms on the Braid Hills did not pass, so such testing will continue.
  - A motion for a scheme for annual grants for friends of parks passed.
  - There was also motion about busking, but this did not fit with legislation.
  - M Birch: the 'future libraries' motion passed. There will be reductions to hours and services but no actual closures.

9 Transport and environment matters (M Birch)

See also report on NTBCC website.

9.a Communal bin review phase 6 consultation update

- CEC has written to residents stating that some areas' services will not change but others will. However, these cannot be the final decisions because it has not yet gone to committee. The letters state that there will not be hybrid service, but CEC had not previously clarified this. Hence NTBCC should submit a deputation. CEC has stated that further information can only be obtained via a Freedom of Information request.
  - P Williamson: NTBCC should question how decisions were made. I have drafted a relevant letter.
  - F Banatvala: CEC is ignoring the positive results from the gull-proof sacks trial.

9.b City mobility plan capital investment plan – NTBCC deputation

- This was submitted. However it appears that the relevant council officer had not seen it. (*ACTION: M BIRCH TO WRITE TO THIS OFFICER TO CLARIFY NTBCC'S POSITION*.)

9.c Cycle hire scheme

- There will be a two-year trial of dockless, GPS-tracked hire cycles. It is planned that this will not be a cost for CEC.

9.d Trams to Newhaven – issues list and actions

- See report.

9.e Edinburgh Bus Users Group AGM

- See report.

9.f Clean air day

- This is on 19 June, but it is not clear what will take place. (The TEC convenor is not aware what is planned.)

10 Any other business

- V Roëves. Do CEC's street-cleansing plans include weeding? Currently, this service is intermittent.
  - M Birch: I have asked for clarification.
  - *ACTION: CLLR MOWAT TO INVESTIGATE*.
- *ACTION: G WELLS TO COMPARE NTBCC'S CURRENT AND PREVIOUS CONSTITUTION*.

DRAFT